

Jennifer A. Bandlow, State Bar No. 265757  
jbandlow@socaljusticelawgroup.com  
George Tourkow, State Bar No. 331070  
gtourkow@socaljusticelawgroup.com  
SoCal Justice Law Group, P.C.  
5670 Wilshire Boulevard, 18th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90036  
Phone: 323-723-3120  
Fax: 310-734-1710

Wilmer J. Harris, State Bar No. 150407  
wharris@sshhzlaw.com  
Kristina A. Harootun, State Bar No. 308718  
kharootun@sshhzlaw.com  
SCHONBRUN SEPLOW HARRIS  
HOFFMAN & ZELDES LLP  
715 Fremont Avenue, Suite A  
South Pasadena, CA 91030  
Phone: (626)441-4129  
Fax: (626)283-5770

Brian T. Dunn, State Bar No. 176502  
bdunn@chocranfirm.com  
The Cochran Firm-California  
4929 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1010  
Los Angeles, CA 90010  
Phone: (323) 435-8205  
Fax: (323) 282-5280

Attorneys for All Plaintiffs

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

AUTUMN SHIBLEY, by and through  
her Successor in Interest, ASHLY  
NORINE PARRISH, ASHLY NORINE  
PARRISH and JOANNA MCCARTHY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

COUNTY OF SAN BERNARDINO;  
SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY CHILD  
AND FAMILY SERVICES; RHONDA  
CUFONE; ROSE PICANINO; and  
DOES 1-10,

Defendants.

**Case No.: 5:19-cv-00065-JGB-SPx**

Assigned to Hon. Jesus G. Bernal  
Magistrate Judge: Sheri Pym

**DISCOVERY MATTER**

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE  
ORDER**

Complaint Filed: 1/10/2019  
Trial Date: 4/26/2022

1     **I.     PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2             Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential or  
3 private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from  
4 use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.

5     Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the  
6 following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order  
7 does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and  
8 that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the  
9 limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the  
10 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section  
11 XIII(C), below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file  
12 confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures  
13 that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks  
14 permission from the Court to file material under seal.

15     **II.    GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

16             This action involves sensitive information and confidential materials  
17 regarding minors which special protection from public disclosure and from use for  
18 any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential  
19 materials are otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be  
20 privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes,  
21 court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of  
22 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of  
23 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to  
24 keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses  
25 of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their  
26 handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order  
27 for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that  
28

1 information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that  
 2 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a  
 3 confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part  
 4 of the public record of this case.

### 5 **III. DEFINITIONS**

6 A. Action: *Autumn Shibley, et. al. v. County of San Bernardino, et. al.* –  
 7 CASE NO. 5:19-CV-00065-JGB (PJWx)

8 B. Challenging Party: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the  
 9 designation of information or items under this Order.

10 C. “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: Information (regardless of  
 11 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for  
 12 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in  
 13 the Good Cause Statement.

14 D. Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as  
 15 their support staff).

16 E. Designating Party: A Party or Non-Party that designates information  
 17 or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as  
 18 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

19 F. Disclosure or Discovery Material: All items or information, regardless  
 20 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,  
 21 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or  
 22 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

23 G. Expert: A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter  
 24 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as  
 25 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

26 H. House Counsel: Attorneys who are employees of a party to this  
 27 Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other  
 28 outside counsel.

I. Non-Party: Any natural person, partnership, corporation, association,

1 or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2 J. Outside Counsel of Record: Attorneys who are not employees of a  
3 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and  
4 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm  
5 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

6 K. Party: Any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,  
7 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their  
8 support staffs).

9 L. Producing Party: A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or  
10 Discovery Material in this Action.

11 M. Professional Vendors: Persons or entities that provide litigation  
12 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or  
13 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)  
14 and their employees and subcontractors.

15 N. Protected Material: Any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is  
16 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

17 O. Receiving Party: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery  
18 Material from a Producing Party.

#### 18 **IV. SCOPE**

19 A. The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only  
20 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or  
21 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or  
22 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or  
23 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

24 B. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders  
25 of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

#### 26 **V. DURATION**

27 A. Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality  
28 obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party

1 agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition  
2 shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this  
3 Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the  
4 completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of  
5 this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for  
6 extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

## 7 **VI. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

### 8 **A. Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection**

- 9 1. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for  
10 protection under this Order must take care to limit any such  
11 designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate  
12 standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection  
13 only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written  
14 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material,  
15 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not  
16 warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.
- 17 2. Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited.  
18 Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have  
19 been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber  
20 the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses  
21 and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to  
22 sanctions.
- 23 3. If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or  
24 items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection,  
25 that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it  
26 is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

### 27 **B. Manner and Timing of Designations**

1. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., Section B(2)(b) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.
2. Designation in conformity with this Order requires the following:
  - a. For information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).
  - b. A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material

on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

c. For testimony given in depositions, that the Designating Party identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.

d. For information produced in form other than document and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

C. Inadvertent Failure to Designate

1. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

## VII. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

A. Timing of Challenges

1. Any party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.

B. Meet and Confer

1. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

C. The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

## **VIII. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

### **A. Basic Principles**

1. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section XIV below.
2. Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

### **B. Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items**

1. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:
  - a. The Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

- b. The officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;
- c. Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);
- d. The Court and its personnel;
- e. Court reporters and their staff;
- f. Professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary or this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to be Bound” attached as Exhibit A hereto;
- g. The author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;
- h. During their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (i) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound;” and (ii) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound,” unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be

separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

- i. Any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

## **IX. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

- A. If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:
  1. Promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
  2. Promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
  3. Cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.
- B. If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the Court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking

1 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these  
2 provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a  
3 Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from  
4 another court.

5 **X. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**  
6 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

7 A. The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a  
8 Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such  
9 information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation  
10 is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing  
11 in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party  
12 from seeking additional protections.

13 B. In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to  
14 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and  
15 the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce  
16 the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

- 17 1. Promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party  
18 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a  
19 confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- 20 2. Promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated  
21 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s),  
22 and a reasonably specific description of the information requested;  
23 and
- 24 3. Make the information requested available for inspection by the  
25 Non-Party, if requested.

26 C. If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within  
27 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the  
28

Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

#### **XI. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

A. If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (1) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (2) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (3) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (4) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

#### **XII. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL**

A. When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege

1 review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar  
2 as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a  
3 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege  
4 or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement  
5 in the Stipulated Protective Order submitted to the Court.

### 6 **XIII. MISCELLANEOUS**

#### 7 **A. Right to Further Relief**

8 1. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its  
9 modification by the Court in the future.

#### 10 **B. Right to Assert Other Objections**

11 1. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives  
12 any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or  
13 producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in  
14 this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any  
15 right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the  
16 material covered by this Protective Order.

#### 17 **C. Filing Protected Material**

18 1. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must  
19 comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be  
20 filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of  
21 the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file  
22 Protected Material under seal is denied by the Court, then the  
23 Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless  
24 otherwise instructed by the Court.

### 25 **XIV. FINAL DISPOSITION**

26 **A.** After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in Section V,  
27 within sixty (60) days of a written request by the Designating Party,  
28

1 each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the  
2 Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision,  
3 “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,  
4 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the  
5 Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or  
6 destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to  
7 the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the  
8 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by  
9 category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was  
10 returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not  
11 retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other  
12 format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material.  
13 Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an  
14 archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and  
15 hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and  
16 trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and  
17 expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material.  
18 Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material  
19 remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section V.

20 B. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate  
21 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or  
22 monetary sanctions.

23 //

24 //

25 //

26 //

27 //

1 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

2  
3 DATED: October 29, 2021

**SOCIAL JUSTICE LAW GROUP**

4 **SCHONBRUN SEPLOW HARRIS**  
5 **HOFFMAN & ZELDES LLP**

6 **THE COCHRAN FIRM CALIFORNIA**

7 */s/ Kristina A. Harootun*

8 By: \_\_\_\_\_

9 Wilmer J. Harris  
10 Kristina A. Harootun  
11 Attorneys for Plaintiff AUTUMN  
12 SHIBLEY, by and through her Successor in  
Interest, ASHLY NORINE PARRISH,  
ASHLY NORINE PARRISH and  
JOANNA MCCARTHY

13 DATED: October 29, 2021

**WALKER LAW GROUP LLP**

14  
15 By: */s/ Jeffrey K. Keyes* \_\_\_\_\_

16 Jeffrey A. Walker  
17 Jeffrey K. Keyes  
18 Nazik Hasan  
19 Attorneys for Defendants  
20 COUNTY OF SAN BERNARDINO,  
RHONDA CUFONE, and ROSE  
PICANINO

21 **FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

22  
23  
24 Dated: February 14, 2022



25 \_\_\_\_\_  
26 United States Magistrate Judge

**EXHIBIT A**  
**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have  
read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issue by the  
United States District Court for the Central District of California on [DATE] in the case of  
\_\_\_\_\_ [insert formal name of the case and the number and  
initials assigned to it by the Court]. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the  
terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure  
to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I  
solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is  
subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict  
compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for  
the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated  
Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this  
action. I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my  
California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings  
related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_